Scoring System and Decision Process
2019

> How does the panel come to a decision?

The panel consists of the five City Council-appointed Boulder Arts Commissioners and four additional community members selected by the commission to enhance public voice and help in decision making. After reading your application, the panel will provide scores and comments.

The questions are divided into two sections:

First, the panel members provide scores on the information you provide in the "Panel Questions" section. Panel members provide a score of 1 to 8 for each panel question.

Second, the panel members provide additional points on three focus areas: 1) for Boulder-based organizations, 2) on issues of cultural equity, and 3) for organizations that have not received funding in the grant cycle. A maximum of 4 additional points is available to the panel members for each question. For more information on cultural equity, please reference our Statement of Cultural Equity.

The scores for each panel member are added together to establish a preliminary score for the application. All questions are weighted equally. Those preliminary scores are averaged across all the panel members to establish a preliminary score. This score is used to rank your application for consideration. For each grant category, the Arts Commission will establish a threshold score (equal to a whole number that is approximately 75% of the maximum possible score) over which an application is considered eligible for an award. Please note that meeting the threshold score does not automatically approve an application for funding.

In addition to providing a score, the commissioners will include questions or comments for each applicant. We will provide these comments to you before the review meeting. During the meeting, you will have the opportunity to offer a three-minute statement answering the questions raised, or further informing the panel about your application.

Later in that same meeting, the panel will discuss each application. Individual panel members may decide to change specific scores based on new information you provide during your presentation. Once this rescore is complete, the applications are re-ranked. The members of the Boulder Arts Commission then deliberate to decide final approval of the applications which will receive a grant. The Arts Commission may a) accept the top scores in the ranking, b) choose to adjust the ranking, or c) ask the panel to reconsider specific scores.

The complete scoring system and rubric can be found below.

> How do the panel members use the scoring system?

Panel members use the following rating scale descriptions to help align their decisions about each score.

Score	Descriptor	Strengths/Weaknesses
8	Exceptional	Exceptionally strong (a model for field or discipline with essentially no weaknesses).
7	Outstanding	Very strong with some minor weaknesses.
6	Very Good	Strong with numerous minor weaknesses.
5	Good	Strong but with at least one moderate weakness.
4	Satisfactory	Some strengths but with some moderate weaknesses.
3	Fair	Some strengths but with at least one major weakness.
2	Marginal	A few strengths and a few major weaknesses.
1	Poor	Very few strengths and numerous major weaknesses.

Minor weakness: An easily addressable weakness that does not substantially lessen impact.
Moderate weakness: A weakness that lessens impact.
Major weakness: A weakness that severely limits impact.

Scoring System Rubrics

> How do the members of the panel interpret the scoring system for each application?

Before the grants awards process begins, panel members are trained in how to interpret the scoring system and rubrics, or set of criteria, which helps reduce the possibility of subjective scores based on personal preferences. Please keep in mind, however, that although panel decisions follow this set of criteria, scores could reflect a small degree of subjectivity individual to each panel member. Panel members must be able to defend their scores with observations about each application's specific strengths or weaknesses during the scoring and re-scoring process.

Following are the scoring systems for various application categories.

General Operating Support Grants, page one

Capacity Building.
How will this grant increase the capacity of your organization to meet goals in your strategic plan or master plan? In what way will this grant increase your organization's sustainability and resiliency? What innovations, growth, or new community benefits will be made possible by this award?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
None, or only a few, strong strategies to improve capacity, sustainability, innovation, growth, or community benefits. Numerous or a few major weaknesses.	Some strong strategies to increase capacity, sustainability, innovation, growth, or community benefits. At least one major weakness or some moderate weaknesses.	Many strengths to increase capacity, sustainability, innovation, growth, or community benefits. But, with at least one moderate weakness or numerous minor weaknesses.	Outstanding case for creating organizational capacity, and improvements to sustainability, innovation, growth, or community benefits. Few or no minor weaknesses.

Community Priorities.
The City of Boulder's Community Cultural Plan is a visioning and strategic document that describes how the people of Boulder will align efforts, with the support of the municipal government, to achieve our collective vision: *Together, we will craft Boulder's social, physical, and cultural environment to include creativity as an essential ingredient for the wellbeing, prosperity, and joy of everyone in the community.* The Community Priorities are six points that summarize the community's most common responses in answer to the question, "What is your vision for Boulder's culture and creative economy?" Reference: Cultural Plan and Community Priorities.

Examples of ways to demonstrate impact on the Community Priorities may include descriptions of how your project or organization:
- Supports artists and creative professionals by providing professional development programming.
- Contributes to Boulder's creative identity and creates a vibrant cultural destination through high artistic merit and excellence in the practice of a medium or discipline.
- Engages the community in civic dialogue about the arts through interactive outreach in the neighborhoods.
- Adds creativity in the public realm by engaging underserved populations in art-making for their community.

In what way will this project contribute to one or one or more of the Community Priorities described in the Community Cultural Plan? Does the project contribute to one priority thoroughly?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Does not or minimally addresses how strategies will contribute to the Community Priorities.	Few or some strategies on how the organization will address the Community Priorities.	Strong strategies on how the organization will address the Community Priorities.	Outstanding or exceptional strategies on how the organization will address the Community Priorities.

General Operating Support Grants, page two

Proposed Outcomes and Evaluation.
Describe your evaluation strategy for this project and how you will collect data. Please also include your goals for this project and how the benefit to the community will be measured. Note: Funding recipients will be asked to include this evaluation as part of their annual reporting.

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Evaluation strategy for understanding program / project success is lacking; goals, measures and plans for data collection are not in place.	Provides only limited descriptions of evaluation strategies and goals with moderate weaknesses.	Provides clear and thoughtful evaluation strategies and goals with a few moderate or minor weaknesses.	Evaluation strategy is comprehensive. Contains detailed information on goals, benchmarks and data collection and how to measure success.

Cultural equity.
Among the goals of the Boulder Arts Commission is to encourage the equitable, fair, and just distribution of funds in support of the community. This includes providing support to applicants whose organizational leadership or audience represent groups who are typically underserved by arts programming and funding models (i.e. culturally diverse groups, organizations focused on age diversity, etc.) Describe how your project does or does not fulfil one or several of these categories. For reference, please review the Boulder Arts Commission Statement on Cultural Equity.

Reference: Boulder Arts Commission Statement on Cultural Equity

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
It offers no or very few advances for equity and diversity.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in a minor way with one or more major or moderate weaknesses.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in a moderate way with few minor weaknesses.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in very good or exceptional ways with one or no minor weaknesses.

Boulder Focus.
Are you a Boulder organization serving Boulder or are you an organization outside of Boulder and to what degree do you focus on Boulder programming?

1	2	3	4
Programs only occasionally offered in Boulder.	Few programs offered in Boulder.	Programs primarily in Boulder; some community ties.	Programs primarily offered in Boulder; strong ties to the community.

Community Project Grant, page one

Community Priorities

The City of Boulder's Community Cultural Plan is a visioning and strategic document that describes how the people of Boulder will align efforts, with the support of the municipal government, to achieve our collective vision: *Together, we will craft Boulder's social, physical, and cultural environment to include creativity as an essential ingredient for the wellbeing, prosperity, and joy of everyone in the community.* The Community Priorities are six points that summarize the community's most common responses in answer to the question, "What is your vision for Boulder's culture and creative economy?" Reference: Cultural Plan and Community Priorities.

Examples of ways to demonstrate impact on the Community Priorities may include descriptions of how your project or organization:

- Supports artists and creative professionals by providing professional development programming.
- Contributes to Boulder's creative identity and creates a vibrant cultural destination through high artistic merit and excellence in the practice of a medium or discipline.
- Engages the community in civic dialogue about the arts through interactive outreach in the neighborhoods.
- Adds creativity in the public realm by engaging underserved populations in art-making for their community.

In what way will this project contribute to one or one or more of the Community Priorities described in the Community Cultural Plan? Does the project contribute to one priority thoroughly?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Does not or minimally addresses how the project will contribute to one or several of the Community Priorities.	Few or some aspects of the project will address one or several of the Community Priorities.	Several aspects of the project will significantly address one or more of the Community Priorities.	The project will address one or more of the Community Priorities in very strong or exceptional ways.

Cultural Offerings

In what way does your project fill a gap in the variety of cultural offerings in Boulder? What is exciting or new about your project?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Minimally fills a gap in the cultural offerings of Boulder with major weaknesses.	A few aspects of the project may fill gaps in cultural offerings with a few major or moderate weaknesses; only modest innovations are proposed.	Some or many aspects of the project fill gaps in cultural offerings with moderate or minor weaknesses; some new or innovative programming.	The project fills gaps in cultural offering in very good or exceptional ways with a few or no minor weaknesses; the project is new and innovative.

Community Project Grant, page two

Cultural equity.

Among the goals of the Boulder Arts Commission is to encourage the equitable, fair, and just distribution of funds in support of the community. This includes providing support to applicants whose organizational leadership or audience represent groups who are typically underserved by arts programming and funding models (i.e. culturally diverse groups, organizations focused on age diversity, etc.) Describe how your project does or does not fulfil one or several of these categories. For reference, please review the Boulder Arts Commission Statement on Cultural Equity.

Reference: Boulder Arts Commission Statement on Cultural Equity

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
It offers no or very few advances for equity and diversity.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in a minor way with one or more major or moderate weaknesses.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in a moderate way with few minor weaknesses.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in very good or exceptional ways with one or no minor weaknesses.

Proposed Outcomes and Evaluation Strategy

Describe your evaluation strategy and how you will collect data. Please include your goals for this project and how you will measure the benefit to the community.

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Evaluation strategy for understanding program / project success is lacking; goals, measures and plans for data collection are not in place.	Provides only limited descriptions of evaluation strategies and goals with moderate weaknesses.	Provides clear and thoughtful evaluation strategies and goals with a few moderate or minor weaknesses.	Evaluation strategy is comprehensive. Contains detailed information on goals, benchmarks and data collection and how to measure success.

Boulder Focus.

Are you a Boulder organization/individual serving Boulder or are you an organization/individual outside of Boulder and to what degree do you focus on Boulder programming?

1	2	3	4
Not based in Boulder; programs only occasionally offered in Boulder.	Not based in Boulder; programs regularly offered in Boulder. Or, based in Boulder with very few programs offered in Boulder.	Not based in Boulder; programs primarily in Boulder; strong community ties. Or, based in Boulder with one or more programs in Boulder.	Based in Boulder; programs primarily offered in Boulder; strong ties to the community.

Encouragement Points

Among the goals of the Boulder Arts Commission is to encourage the equitable, fair, and just distribution of funds in support of the community. This includes providing support to applicants who have not yet received a grant in this cycle. Confirm if your organization has been funded in the current cycle.

1	2	3	4
Received a grant this year.	Received a grant this year.	Did not receive a grant this year.	Did not receive a grant this year.

Arts Education Projects Grant, page one

Benefit to Students.
In what ways will this project directly benefit the students and their growth as cultural participants or in the creative industries? What new skills or experiences will be offered?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Benefits to students in cultural participation or skill development are not or inadequately addressed with many major weaknesses.	The project will benefit students' cultural participation or skill development in only a few minor ways.	Many significant benefits to cultural participation or skill development are proposed with a few minor weaknesses.	Benefits to cultural participation or skill development are very good or exceptional with only a few or no minor weaknesses.

Complementing Curriculum and Offerings.
How does this project enhance, or fill a gap in, the generally available curriculum and offerings?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
The project does not demonstrate any enhancements to curriculum.	Enhancements to curriculum or offerings are modest with many major or moderate weaknesses.	There are clear enhancements to curriculum and offerings with only a few minor weaknesses.	The project has very good or exceptional enhancements to curriculum and offerings with only a few or no minor weaknesses.

Proposed Outcomes and Evaluation Strategy.
How will the benefits to the students be measured?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
The outcomes and evaluation strategy are not or inadequately addressed with many major weaknesses.	The outcomes and evaluation strategy are addressed in a few minor ways.	The outcomes and evaluation strategy are addressed in a significant and positive way, with a few minor weaknesses.	The project addresses outcomes and evaluation in a very good or excellent way with only a few or no minor weaknesses.

Community Priorities.
The City of Boulder's Community Cultural Plan is a visioning and strategic document that describes how the people of Boulder will align efforts, with the support of the municipal government, to achieve our collective vision: *Together, we will craft Boulder's social, physical, and cultural environment to include creativity as an essential ingredient for the wellbeing, prosperity, and joy of everyone in the community.* The Community Priorities are six points that summarize the community's most common responses in answer to the question, "What is your vision for Boulder's culture and creative economy?" Reference: Cultural Plan and Community Priorities.

Examples of ways to demonstrate impact on the Community Priorities may include descriptions of how your project or organization:
- Supports artists and creative professionals by providing professional development programming.
- Contributes to Boulder's creative identity and creates a vibrant cultural destination through high artistic merit and excellence in the practice of a medium or discipline.
- Engages the community in civic dialogue about the arts through interactive outreach in the neighborhoods.
- Adds creativity in the public realm by engaging underserved populations in art-making for their community.

Arts Education Projects Grant, page two

In what way will this project contribute to one or one or more of the Community Priorities described in the Community Cultural Plan? Does the project contribute to one priority thoroughly?

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
Does not or minimally addresses how the project will contribute to one or several of the Community Priorities.	Few or some aspects of the project will address one or several of the Community Priorities.	Several aspects of the project will significantly address one or more of the Community Priorities.	The project will address one or more of the Community Priorities in very strong or exceptional ways.

Cultural equity.
Among the goals of the Boulder Arts Commission is to encourage the equitable, fair, and just distribution of funds in support of the community. This includes providing support to applicants whose organizational leadership or audience represent groups who are typically underserved by arts programming and funding models (i.e. culturally diverse groups, organizations focused on age diversity, etc.) Describe how your project does or does not fulfil one or several of these categories. For reference, please review the Boulder Arts Commission Statement on Cultural Equity.

Reference: Boulder Arts Commission Statement on Cultural Equity

1-2: Poor to Marginal	3-4: Fair to Satisfactory	5-6: Good to Very Good	7-8: Outstanding to Exceptional
It offers no or very few advances for equity and diversity.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in a minor way with one or more major or moderate weaknesses.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in a moderate way with few minor weaknesses.	The project addresses issues of equity and diversity in very good or exceptional ways with one or no minor weaknesses.

Boulder Focus.
Are you a Boulder organization/individual serving Boulder or are you an organization/individual outside of Boulder and to what degree do you focus on Boulder programming?

1	2	3	4
Not based in Boulder; programs only occasionally offered in Boulder.	Not based in Boulder; programs regularly offered in Boulder. Or, based in Boulder with very few programs offered in Boulder.	Not based in Boulder; programs primarily in Boulder; strong community ties. Or, based in Boulder with one or more programs in Boulder.	Based in Boulder; programs primarily offered in Boulder; strong ties to the community.

Encouragement Points.
Among the goals of the Boulder Arts Commission is to encourage the equitable, fair, and just distribution of funds in support of the community. This includes providing support to applicants who have not yet received a grant in this cycle. Confirm if your organization has been funded in the current cycle.

1	2	3	4
Received a grant this year.	Received a grant this year.	Did not receive a grant this year.	Did not receive a grant this year.